



Review 2016-2022

Introduction

A think tank that analyzes the major challenges facing global healthcare, our "Think Tank" created in 2016, aims to support French political decision-makers in developing a more coherent, effective strategy that sets priorities in line with the resources at their disposal.

Our aim is to produce, disseminate and promote ideas, analyses and recommendations likely to influence the public policies and strategies of French players in the field of global health. Ultimately, our group hopes to contribute to the creation and animation of a French-speaking Global Health Community.

The principles and operating procedures of the Think Tank are briefly outlined in Box 1.

Box 1: Think Tank principles and operating procedures

Operating principles: *Political independence / Participation of individual members (not on behalf of their respective organizations) / Confidentiality of debates / Collective positions (not systematically reflecting the opinion of all group members).*

How it works :

- *Organization of two annual 2 ½-day seminars in the French provinces to review activities over the six months, reflect collectively and plan future activities.*
- *Organization of monthly two-hour plenary brainstorming sessions in face-to-face or remote mode; since March 2020, these sessions have been held twice a month in remote mode only, following the COVID-19 crisis.*
- *Thematic meetings in the form of working groups may be decided at plenary meetings.*
- *Meeting agendas are drawn up by the coordinator in conjunction with the Think Tank [office](#).*

We felt it was important to take stock of the activities of our "Think Tank" over the past 5 years, which have been marked by the COVID-19 crisis that has mobilized many of our members.

We considered the following questions: What were our main messages? How did we communicate them? Could other approaches have been more relevant? What was our impact?

The analysis we undertook to produce this report was based on a number of preliminary considerations, which are outlined in Box 2.

The pages that follow are food for thought as we consider our objectives and the way we're going to work in the years ahead.

Box 2: How do you assess a Think Tank? A few preliminary thoughts

1) This assessment covers our choice of targets, themes and methods of influence, which have led us to produce notes, articles and studies.

2) The question of the extent to which we have actually influenced decisions according to sensitive or specific criteria is a difficult one: did our action actually change things (sensitivity)? would they have been different if we had not been involved (specificity)?

3) It's also important to put our results into perspective by taking into account our means (obligation of means and results), as well as the discrepancy between our profile - highly influenced by the presence among us of several members known to the media - and the reality of our means.

4) This is an analytical review, not an assessment that would require an outside perspective.
"Think Tank.

1) Themes for discussion 2016-2022

The vast majority of the topics we worked on were defined collectively, at our biannual seminars or at our monthly or fortnightly meetings during the COVID-19 pandemic (**Box 1**). They are developed in **Appendices 1 and 2** attached to this report. Our themes of reflection can be categorized as follows:

- ***One overarching theme:*** global health (or the "global health" approach, which we wanted to raise awareness of and promote on the political agenda):
- ***These are themes that have been with us almost continuously since the creation of the "Think Tank:***
 - France's global health institutions
 - Health democracy
 - Health human resources
 - Global health governance.
 - The role of scientific evidence in political decision-making
- ***In-depth topics*** that we have chosen to put on the agenda:
 - Tomorrow's healthcare professions
 - French influence in Geneva
 - Global Fund and health systems strengthening.

These subjects have been the subject of notes resulting from in-depth studies over the course of a year, and have benefited from specific funding and the support of young researchers.

- ***Windows of opportunity seized over time:***
 - *Reaction to words such as :*
 - Emmanuel Macron's Ouagadougou speech (article in Mediapart) ;
 - The WHO target of 70% Covid vaccination coverage (Opinion column in [Libération](#) ;
 - *Debates* in which, in reaction to current events, we took a stand on :
 - Promotion of Artemisia herbal teas / screening at the French National Assembly of the film "Malaria Business" (note in 2018); since then, Artemisia has been the subject of a WHO positioning and a research project supported by AVIESAN.

- The risk of abolishing the European Commissioner for Health (note and tribune in 2019)
- The importance of health democracy in crisis management COVID- 19
- *Interventions at key moments on the agenda or at key political moments* when we wanted to position ourselves to contribute to the debate or influence French policies, such as :
 - Tuberculosis ahead of the high-level conference in September 2019
 - The challenges facing UNAIDS as management changes
 - The Global Fund's approach to health systems strengthening ahead of the 2019 Replenishment Conference in France
 - Strengthening the role of research in France's new Official Development Assistance (ODA) law (August 2021)
 - The importance of digital healthcare and France's place in the global discussion on these subjects, following the urgency of its development revealed by the COVID-19 crisis (note and high-level meeting).

We have also initiated discussions on a number of subjects, but have not yet produced a note: access to medicines, the role of private-sector players or human resources in health (*a simple note for the T7 group, which brings together the main Think Tanks of the G7 member countries*).

2) Think Tank's main targets

We can categorize three types of targets:

- Political decision-makers, elected officials and ministerial advisors
- High-level executives (more familiar with the technical aspects of global health)
- Global health players, a broader group (NGOs, researchers, etc.) with more experience, in France and elsewhere.
- Science and academia

3) Modalities of influence

Various levers of influence have been mobilized since October 2016:

3a) Written documents (see appendices 1 and 2) :

- A white paper and manifesto (our vision of global health)
- 24 thematic notes (targeted or distributed to our entire mailing list). We have four different types of note to carry our advocacy message
 - 19 political notes
 - 3 study notes
 - 2 lighting notes

Several short policy briefs/information notes/direct letters to public authorities (increase in French contribution to Unitaid, ACT-A, etc.).

Some of the notes were written with the help of outside experts¹

- 11 speeches, articles, publications in magazines or the press, carried collectively by the group or signed by certain members in particular - but which can be categorized as emanating from the "Think Tank".

3b) Meetings

- Institutional meetings, mainly with Élysée advisors, but also with the Global Health Ambassador, the Ministry of Health's international advisors, the Presidential Council for Africa, the Delegation for European and International Affairs (DAEI), Members of Parliament, etc.
- Meetings organized by others, but which we have stimulated: such as a meeting at Bercy on digital health² or a meeting at the French Embassy in Berlin, aimed at strengthening links between France and Germany in the field of global health.
- Think Tank hearings at other institutions (Senate on global healthcare governance / CESE on European healthcare)
- Hearings of outside personalities at our meetings³. These hearings were both opportunities to gather information and privileged discussions to develop our advocacy.
- Participation in themed lunches or dinners

3c) Events :

- 3 breakfasts with MPs on the premises of Sciences-Po Paris, which were abandoned due to their limited impact on decision-making by the National Assembly;
- 2 conferences in partnership with Sciences-Po Paris (October 4, 2017 and June 2019)
- Three webinars co-organized with others (not including participation in webinars organized by others)
 - With Terra Nova on the links between science and politics
 - With the Jacques Delors Institute on pandemic preparedness and response
 - With the European Health Forum Gastein on European global health strategy

3d) Communication tools :

- Mailing list: Around 25 press reviews: "What's new in global health?" have been distributed since June 2018, bringing together scientific, periodical or institutional articles in English or French on current events in global health⁴. Other information (notably on organized events) has been disseminated through this channel

¹ Guillaume Breton, Yazdan Yazdanpanah and Xavier Blanc on the Tuberculosis note / Mélanie Heard, Fabrice Aubert and Philippe Jashan on health democracy, Florence Gaudry-Perkins and several people on digital health,

² A meeting stimulated by the Think Tank but organized by Cédric O with several Think Tank people (Jean-François Delfraissy, Annabel Desgrées du Loû, Stéphanie Tchiombiano), Florence Gaudry Perkins, on September 28, 2021, at Bercy, on digital health topics.

³ These include Antoine Flahault, Bruno Rivalan, Christophe Paquet, Cyrille Pierre, Grégoire Lurton, Jean-Marc Châtaigner, Jim Campbell, Maria Neira, Mélanie Heard, Michèle Boccoz, Nathalie Bajos, Pauline, Valery Ridde, Yazdan Yazdanpanah, Yvonne Mburu.

⁴ The following themes have been archived on our website: Retrospective 2019 (January 2020), Health security (February 2020), Gender and health (March 2020), Think Tank publications (June 2020), Covid-19 and health democracy (October 2020), Europe and global health (December 2020), One Health (January 2021), Health as a global public good (March 2021), Covid-19 and its impact on gender (Summer 2021), Unequal access to covid vaccines (October 2021), Digital health (December 2021), Human resources for health (February 2022), War and global health (March 2022).

- A strong presence on social networks (especially Linked In), with a desire to expand on Twitter

Box 3: How think tanks exert influence

The Think Tank's modes of influence can be direct (direct interaction of the Think Tank with decision-makers) or indirect (by ricochet, when collective reflection enables personalities within the group to contribute to their positions, and each of them carries part of the group's message in their respective missions).

In addition to these forms of influence, we gather information and take part in meetings and/or symposia. Ongoing participation in MEAE meetings on various topics (preparation of Unitaid Board of Directors, Global Fund, Gavi, Global Fund team, French global health strategy).

4) Think Tank" partners

4a) Financial partners :

- ANRS-MIE: operating funding: €50,000 then €75,000 per year since June 2018.
- AFD: financing of two studies 1) Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria (25,000 euros in 2019), 2) Human Resources in Health (45,000 euros in 2022-2023)
- Ad hoc funding: Fondation Mérieux (5,000 euros in 2019) and WHO (5,000 in 2020)

4b) Non-financial partners

- Sciences po Paris - two lectures and three breakfasts
- Université Paris 1 - Panthéon Sorbonne - two lectures
- German "Think Tank": Interaction with Mathias Bonk (participation in our conference at Sciences Po in 2019)
- Terra Nova - Organization of a joint seminar, September 4, ²⁰²⁰.
- Institut Delors - Webinar with Institut Delors on June 24, 2021
- European Health Forum Gastein (Austrian Think Tank) - organization of a joint webinar on European health strategy

4c) Participation in global health networks

We are members of the ^{Think6} network and Louis Pizarro took part in the T7 group in 2022.

⁵ "The scientist and the politician. L'expérience du conseil scientifique" with Jean-François Delfraissy, "Le triangle science - politique - société", Daniel Benamouzig, "L'expertise et la décision". Moderator: Mélanie Heard Is international cooperation still possible? Michel Kazatchkine, "Réponse internationale et gouvernance mondiale de la riposte au Covid" and Alain Fischer, "Les problèmes de la vaccination et de l'accès au vaccin". Moderated by Olivier Nay.

Also taking part in this joint seminar were Marisol Touraine, marc Olivier Padis, Hugues Lagrange, Thierry Pech, Daniel Lenoir, Bernard Manin, Frédéric Sawicki, Sébastien Weg, Benoît Miribel, Eric Fleuletot, Frédéric Goyet, Stéphanie Tchiombiano, Annabel desgrées du Lou, Clémentine Paliot, marie paule Kieny, A report is available in the appendices.

⁶ Think Tanks, Health policy Institutions, Networks and Knowledge,

5) Here are a few examples of work on targeted themes with potential impact

By way of example, we present in Appendix 3 the main messages, methods of action (notes, forums, conferences, etc.) and results of the group's work on four major themes: the Global Fund and France's global health strategy, France's institutional structure for global health, Europe and global health, and the role of researchers in global health policies.

6) Conclusions and outlook

Our "Think Tank" is clearly part of the "Global Health" landscape in France, but it has very little resonance beyond national borders, including in French-speaking countries, and expanding our audience beyond France is an objective for the future.

It's important to anticipate future assessments of the think tank. It's not easy to assess our impact a posteriori, without having defined indicators and targets *in advance*. For the next five-year period⁷, it will be useful to question our interlocutors and systematically identify, for each theme or each note, the target person(s) or group(s) and the success or failure criteria for documenting our impact.

- Decisions based on our recommendations
- Appropriation of our analyses by other players
- Ideas or research results that we have translated / popularized / made more accessible to decision-makers
- Moments / Places for exchange that we have helped to build or animate
- Contributing to the creation of a French-speaking "global health" community

This stocktaking exercise also leads us to some considerations for the future:

Our preoccupations to date have been mainly international, apart from the reflection on health democracy which included France. The COVID-19 pandemic shows how essential it is to **move towards a global approach to global health**, including all countries, including France and Europe.

This global reflection could include subjects on which we are already working (Human Resources in Health) or on which we have not yet positioned ourselves (Health and Environment/"One Health", Migration and Health, Access to Medicines, for example).

It could also be carried out with greater involvement of new generations (future decision-makers, young researchers), the research community and colleagues from low-income countries.

In the future, the think tank should take greater account of the work agendas of the boards (and its committees) and international organizations in which France plays an important role, and try to deepen the analysis and strategic alternatives in order to :

- a. Contribute to a more systemic vision of the issues under discussion, and to more "informed" positions on key subjects;
- b. Facilitate the building of more effective alliances with other partners and donor countries.

⁷ In the future, we could draw on CIRAD's societal impact assessment methods (<https://www.cirad.fr/nos-activites-notre-impact/notre-impact>) or use the OECD criteria (ref to be included in footnote) as a source of inspiration for the exercise.

The group needs to be strengthened in terms of financial and human resources for optimal operation in order to expand our audience. A strategic development plan has been drawn up collectively.

Appendices

Appendix 1: List of policy briefs (including short briefs), study briefs, background briefs.

	Date	Momentum / comments (Type of notes or other text and comment)
2017		
White Paper	March 2017	
Health is a priority for the Sahel	November 2017	
2018		
Breathing new life into tuberculosis	July 2018	Preparing the high-level meeting at the Assembly of the United Nations
Can Artemisia leaf tea help eliminate malaria?	November 2018	Following the screening of the film "Malaria Business" at the French National Assembly
Contribution to the preparation of the next Global Fund Replenishment Conference	December 2018	Global Fund Replenishment Conference
Our vision of global health	December 2018	Manifesto
2019		
The French institutional framework for global health: reflections and proposals	April 2019	
A European health commissioner is essential for the health of Europeans	July 2019	
The importance of research	September 2019	Note sent to the Ministry of Higher Education and Research. Proposal to include an article on research in the new ODA law
UNAIDS: what challenges, what future?	October 2019.	Change of direction
Representations of French influence in global health within organizations based in Geneva	December 2019	
2020		
Structuring the academic field of global health in France	January 2020	
Representations of France's influence on global health in Geneva	February 2020	Survey Report
Gender and sexual health (sexual health and gender inequalities)	March 2020	Lighting note, With Nathalie Bajos
More active French diplomacy in global health.	April 2020	Short note published on the World Health 2030
Support WHO in its role of coordinating the global management of the epidemic Covid-19	April 2020	

Inclusion and participation of the whole of society in the response to Covid-19. Food for thought	April 2020.	
France's contribution to ACT-A, the health systems resilience pillar.	May 2020	Short note published on the World Health 2030 website
Anticipating the evaluation of the international response to the first wave of Covid-19: challenges, expectations and points for attention	June 2020	
The Global Fund and health systems strengthening	September 2020	Study by Anne Beckelynck
Should we save the OMS soldier?	July 2020	Olivier Nay, partnership with Terra Nova
2021		
The Franco-German axis, a driving force in global healthcare	January 2021	
Drawing up the new French strategy in global health: the art and the way	March 2021	
Digital health and global health	November 2021	
2022		
The French Presidency of the European Union: what's at stake for global health?	January 2022	Lighting note
Health training and research in France: Closing the gap in France	May 2022	

Appendix 2: Publication of editorials and articles

2017

- Opinion piece in the Huffington Post: "[Can Macron become an advocate for global health?](#)", published on December 4, 2018 and reaction to the Ouagadougou speech (28 November)

2019

- Interview with Jean-François Delfraissy in [Priorité Santé](#), about our June 5 conference, on RFI, June 6, 2019.
- Article on the institutional health system, for [Aidspace magazine](#) (summary of our round table at the June 5 conference), June 13, 2019.
- Opinion column in Le Monde, "[Il faut conserver un commissaire européen à la santé](#)", September 4, 2019.
- Opinion piece in the Lancet: "[The Global Fund's Sixth Replenishment Conference: a challenge for France, a challenge for Global Health](#)", October 5, 2019, just a few days before the... Global Fund Replenishment Conference in Lyon.

2020

- Opinion column in Le Monde "[L'Organisation mondiale de la santé que nous voulons pour demain](#)", April 29, 2020 (signed by Michel Kazatchkine, Marie- Paule Kieny, Lelio Marmora, Olivier Nay, Stéphanie Tchiombiano and all the members of the Think tank Santé mondiale 2030, as part of a collective of specialists in international public health issues).
- Opinion piece in the Lancet, "[The WHO we want](#)", June 5, 2020.

2021

- Opinion column for Le Monde "[Covid-19 : c'est une erreur d'opposer la répartition mondiale des vaccins et les recommandations d'une dose de rappel](#)", October 17, 2021, signed by Think Tank members, including Françoise Barré-Sinoussi, Paul Benkimoun, Annabel Desgrées du Loû, Michel Kazatchkine, Marie-Paule Kieny, Olivier Nay and Agnès Soucat.

2022

- Article "[Assessing the international response to the Covid-19 crisis: challenges, difficulties and prospects](#)", January 27, 2022 in Horizons Publics. Signed by Agathe Claude and Stéphanie Tchiombiano.
- Article "[Bridging the gap between science and policy in global health governance](#)", March 1, 2022, signed by members of the Think Tank, including Françoise Barré-Sinoussi and Olivier Nay.
- Article "[La santé: avec les patients, pas sans eux](#)" ("[Healthcare: with patients, not without them](#)") March 4, 2022 in Libération. Signed by Françoise Barré-Sinoussi, Paul Benkimoun, Olivier Nay and Stéphanie Tchiombiano.

Appendix 3: 4 Examples of work on specific themes :

1) The Global Fund and France's global health strategy

What message?

Seize the opportunity of the Fund's Replenishment Conference in Lyon in October 2019 to launch a new global health dynamic in France, and thus reposition ourselves on the global health agenda.

How can we help?

- Note "Contribution à la préparation de la prochaine conférence de reconstitution du Fonds mondial", presented
 - to the Global Health Ambassador and MEAE
 - at a hearing before the French National AIDS Council (by Stéphanie Tchiombiano and Frédéric Goyet)
 - To Philippe Etienne, Marie Fontanel, Jennifer Moreau (Elysée)
 - in Vietnam, at a meeting of ambassadors by Françoise Barré-Sinoussi and François Dabis
 - to the Minister of Health's international advisor
- An article in the Lancet questioning President Macron
- Article by Stéphanie Tchiambano on lessons from the Global Fund Replenishment Conference in International Health Policies. The article is available [here](#).
- Study financed by the French Development Agency (AFD)
- **Co-organization of a Webinar "Rethinking Global Fund involvement to strengthen health systems"** with AFD on September 29, 2020. Participation by Jean-François Delfraissy, Marie-Paule Kieny, Éric Fleutelot, Paul Benkimoun and Stéphanie Tchiombiano. This Webinar was an opportunity to present the results of Anne Bekelyneck's study and the Think Tank's recommendations for changing the Global Fund's involvement. Available [here](#).
- Interview with Anne Bekelyneck for Transversal "**The Global Fund must clarify its approach to strengthening community health systems**", November 21, 2020. Available [here](#).
- Dissemination of study results and recommendations at a Global Fund Board luncheon in French

What are the potential impacts?

- Influence on the language used by French policy-makers in their arguments vis-à-vis other countries?
- Advocacy with the government / involvement in the replenishment of the Fund?
- Impact on the new Global Fund strategy, in which HSR is given greater prominence?

2) France's global health system.

What message:

France's institutional framework for global health needs to evolve to meet the challenges ahead, and to become more coherent, clearer and more effective?

Our 13 recommendations are organized along three lines:

- Improve the coherence/readability of France's global health strategy.
(1) Clarify the roles and responsibilities of the various public players, (2) Involve the Ministry of Health to a greater extent, (3) Set targets to be achieved, an

- (4) Strengthen dedicated human resources, in Paris and in the field;
- Consolidate France's leadership in global healthcare.
 - (5) Continue to promote France's commitment to global healthcare at presidential level, (6) Build strategic alliances with other countries sharing a common vision and interests with France, (7) Coordinate and strengthen links with European healthcare strategies, (8) Invest (or reinvest) in multilateral global healthcare arenas;
- Strengthen the management of French intervention in global health.
 - (9) Create a "French alliance for global health", bringing together all players involved in global health, (10) Define a new role for Agence Française de Développement (AFD) in healthcare, (11) Ensure effective coordination of players on the ground abroad, (12) Instill a culture of evaluation, (13) Put research and higher education at the heart of France's global health agenda.

How can we help?

- First elements in the 2017 white paper
- Specific note on this subject (Presentation to Stéphanie Seydoux, Jean-François Pactet, Grégory Emery, Marie Fontanel, Rémy Rioux, Valérie Thomas)
- Study of France's influence in Geneva
- Conference at Sciences po Paris
- Interview with Jean-François Delfraissy in *Priorité Santé*, about our June 5 conference, on RFI, June 6, 2019.

What are the potential impacts?

- Increasing the size of the MEAE workforce in Paris?
 - Creation of a "global health" group, dynamic since the FM replenishment conference - large number of participants
 - Greater involvement of researchers
 - Despite our plea for leadership from the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs seems to remain the real driver.
-

3) Europe and Global Health (see Frédéric Goyet)

Our message:

Healthcare must be a truly European issue. Europe needs a real ~~European~~ strategy for healthcare in Europe (lessons from COVID) and worldwide. In particular, the Franco-German axis must be strengthened

How we work

- An article in *Le Monde*, "Il faut donner une vraie place à la santé dans la prochaine Commission européenne", September 4, 2019
- A meeting in Berlin (October 2019): Organization of a Franco-German meeting at our initiative with the Global Health Institute in Berlin. The meeting was held on October 27, 2019 at the French Embassy to reflect together (1) on common points / differences in the approaches of the two countries, (2) the respective positions of the two countries with regard to the major debates on global health, (3) possible areas of cooperation.

- A note on the Franco-German axis in November 2020
- Participation by Marie-Paule Kieny, Louis Pizarro and Michel Kazatchkine (on behalf of the Think Tank) in a virtual meeting organized by the French Embassy in Berlin (virtual), on October 26, 2020, on the Franco-German axis of Global Health.
- Drafting of a note on the French Presidency of the European Union in December 2021. The note follows the same "enlightenment" format as the note on sexual health we wrote with Nathalie Bajos, which is available here. It outlines the main features of the PFUE, elements concerning the Europe of health and Europe's place in global health. The note was distributed in early January 2022.
- Virtual meeting with Dimitri Grygowski (Ministry of Health) on December 1, 2021 to discuss the French Presidency of the European Union.
- Séphanie Tchiombiano's hearing with the Economic, Social and Environmental Council (CESE) on the subject
- A webinar co-organized with the "Think Tank" European health Forum Gastein, on European strategy

What are the potential impacts?

- The Health Commission has not been abolished
- The World Health Summit conference is increasingly attended by French players, and the French Embassy in Berlin organizes an annual meeting on collaboration between France and Germany in the field of global health.
- The decision was taken to draw up a genuine European global health strategy during the French Presidency of the European Union.

4) The role of researchers in global health strategies Our

messages

- Involve researchers more / take better account of research findings and scientific evidence in global health strategies
- Request for a mapping mission of the academic world in France

How we work :

- Recommendations in several successive documents (white paper, institutional framework, etc.)
- Draft an article dedicated to this issue to amend the law on Official Development Assistance (ODA).
- Note on Strengthening the role of research in the ODA law
- Note "Structuring the academic field of Global Health in France", in December 2019. This note calls for a mission lasting a few months, dedicated to analyzing, formulating proposals and defining an academic field of global health in France, in perfect harmony with the country's international action in the field of health.
- Organization of a joint Seminar with Terra Nova, on September 4, 2020. Two round tables were organized. **"The scholar and the politician. The council experience**

scientifique " avec Jean-François Delfraissy, " Le triangle science - politique - société ", Daniel Benamouzig, " L'expertise et la décision ". Moderator: Mélanie Heard

- Participation of Stéphanie Tchiombiano and Annabel Desgrées du Loû in a meeting organized by IRD with all health directors on November 16 and 17, 2021, to discuss the definition of global health. -
- Interview by Jean-François Delfraissy with the IGAS team on the academic dimension of global health (Aquilino Morelle)
- Policy brief on global health education and training: closing the French gap

What are the potential impacts?

- Greater involvement of researchers in the field of global health/Publication of a global health brochure by IRD, etc.
- Mission of François Dabis / IGAS mission